

Language Transfer



THE CAMBRIDGE APPLIED LINGUISTICS SERIES

Series editors: Michael H. Long and Jack C. Richards

This new series presents the findings of recent work in applied linguistics which are of direct relevance to language teaching and learning and of particular interest to applied linguists, researchers, language teachers, and teacher trainers.

In this series:

Interactive Approaches to Second Language Reading edited by Patricia L. Carrell, Joanne Devine, and David E. Eskey

Second Language Classrooms – Research on teaching and learning by Craig Chaudron

Language Learning and Deafness edited by Michael Strong

The Learner-Centred Curriculum by David Nunan

The Second Language Curriculum edited by Robert Keith Johnson

Language Transfer – Cross-linguistic influence in language learning by Terence Odlin

Linguistic Perspectives on Second Language Acquisition edited by Susan M. Gass and Jaquelyn Schachter

Learning Strategies in Second Language Acquisition by J. Michael O'Malley and Anna Uhl Chamot

The Development of Second Language Proficiency edited by Birgit Harley, Patrick Allen, Jim Cummins and Merrill Swain

Second Language Writing – Research insights for the classroom edited by Barbara Kroll

Genre Analysis – English in academic and research settings by John M. Swales

Evaluating Second Language Education edited by J. Charles Alderson and Alan Beretta

Perspectives on Pedagogical Grammar edited by Terence Odlin

Academic Listening edited by John Flowerdew

Power and Inequality in Language Education edited by James W. Tollefson

Language Program Evaluation - Theory and practice by Brian K. Lynch

Sociolinguistics and Language Teaching edited by Sandra Lee McKay and Nancy H. Hornberger

Contrastive Rhetoric – Cross-cultural aspects of second language writing by Ulla Connor

Teacher Cognition in Language Teaching – Beliefs, decision-making, and classroom practice by Devon Woods

Second Language Vocabulary Acquisition – A rationale for pedagogy edited by James Coady and Thomas Huckin



Language Transfer

Cross-linguistic influence in language learning

Terence Odlin

The Ohio State University





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, United Kingdom 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Cambridge University Press 1989

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1989 Sixth printing 1997

Typeset in Sabon

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Odlin, Terence.

Language transfer / Terence Odlin.

p. cm. - (Cambridge applied linguistics series)

Bibliography: p.

Includes index.

ISBN 0-521-37168-6 hardback. ISBN 0-521-37809-5 paperback

1. Language transfer (Language learning). I. Title. II. Series.

P118.25.035 1989

418 - dc19

88-30760

CIP

British Library Cataloging in Publication Data

Odlin, Terence

Language transfer. – (The Cambridge applied linguistics series).

1. Foreign languages. Learning. Role of native languages.

I. Title

418'.007

ISBN 0-521-37168-6 hardback ISBN 0-521-37809-5 paperback

Transferred to digital printing 2003



In memory of Walter Odlin 1908–1985



Contents

	es ed: face	itors' preface ix xi		
1	Intro	oduction 1		
2	Earlier thinking on transfer 6			
	2.1	Languages (and dialects) in contact 6		
	2.2	Transfer as a controversy in language teaching	15	
3	Som	e fundamental problems in the study of transfer	25	
	3.1	Problems of definition 25		
	3.2	Problems of comparison 28		
		Problems of prediction 35		
	3.4	Problems of generalization 43		
4	Disc	course 48		
	4.1	Politeness 49		
	4.2	Coherence 58		
	4.3	Discourse transfer and other factors 64		
	4.4	Summary and conclusion 69		
5	Sem	Semantics 71		
	5.1	Propositional semantics 71		
	5.2	Lexical semantics 77		
	5.3	Summary and conclusion 83		
6	Synt	ax 85		
	6.1	Word order 85		
	6.2	Relative clauses 97		
	6.3	Negation 104		
	6.4	Summary and conclusion 110		
7		netics, phonology, and writing systems 112		
	/.1	General versus specific predictions 112		

vii



viii	C	Contents		
		Phonetic and phonological transfer 113	120	
		Pronunciation, language universals, and typologies	120	
		Writing systems 124		
	7.5	Summary and conclusion 127		
8	Non	structural factors in transfer 129		
	8.1	Individual variation 130		
	8.2	Transfer and age of acquisition 136		
	8.3	Transfer, linguistic awareness, and social context	140	
9		king back and looking ahead 151 Some caveats 151		
	9.2	Some conclusions 152		
	9.3	Some areas for further research 155		
10 Implications for teaching 157				
Glo	ssary	165		
References 171				
Language index 197				
Author index 201				
Subject index 207				



Series editors' preface

Language transfer has been a central issue in applied linguistics, second language acquisition, and language teaching for at least a century. Within the last few decades, however, its importance in second language learning has been reassessed several times. In the 1950s it was often deemed the most important factor to consider in theories of second language learning as well as in approaches to second language teaching. In the 1960s its importance waned as learners' errors were seen not as evidence of language transfer but rather of "the creative construction process." Some researchers virtually denied the existence of language transfer in their enthusiasm for universalist explanations. In recent years, however, a more balanced perspective has emerged in which the role of transfer is acknowledged and in which transfer is seen to interact with a host of other factors in ways not yet fully understood.

This reassessment of the significance of language transfer is lucidly demonstrated in this new addition to the Cambridge Applied Linguistics Series. In this timely book, Terry Odlin presents a comprehensive and original account of the nature of language transfer and its role in second language acquisition. Dr. Odlin documents the historical development of the concept of language transfer, explores the role of transfer in discourse, semantics, syntax, phonology, and writing systems, and examines the way language transfer interacts with linguistic as well as cultural, social, and personal factors in second language learning and use. In the process, he surveys a large body of literature and examines data from many different languages.

Dr. Odlin's analysis challenges simplistic notions of language transfer and offers instead a convincing account of the process as a phenomenon that is fundamental to research in second language acquisition and applied linguistics. This book will hence be invaluable to students entering the field of second language acquisition, researchers, language teachers, and anyone interested in the fundamental question of how language systems interact during the process of sec-



x Series editors' preface

ond language acquisition. We are therefore delighted to be able to make Dr. Odlin's research available to a wider audience through the Cambridge Applied Linguistics Series.

Michael H. Long Jack C. Richards



Preface

The significance of cross-linguistic influences has long been a controversial topic. As this book indicates, the controversy has had a long life not only among second language teachers and researchers, but also among linguists interested in questions of language contact and language change. Although it would be too much to hope that this book will cause such a long-standing controversy to die, the discussion of transfer here may help to set to rest some dubious claims and to point the way toward more productive thinking about cross-linguistic influences. While I have tried hard to avoid the sweeping claims that unfortunately have been frequent in discussions of transfer, I make no secret of my belief that transfer is an extremely important factor in second language acquisition. The available evidence, I feel, warrants that belief. Thus, the focus of this book is on empirical investigations of learners' behavior in many contexts. There is some discussion of the pedagogical implications of certain investigations, but it seems to me that relatively little is known about the best ways to make use of transfer research in the classroom - hopefully, more teachers and teacher trainers will begin to think about what those ways are. There is also some discussion of theoretical work in other areas of linguistics, but I have made efforts to limit that discussion, which could go on interminably, and to limit the jargon that usually accompanies such discussion. Readers familiar with Government and Binding, Schema Theory, and Sprachbund will not find those terms, though they will note allusions to research using those terms. Some background in linguistics will be helpful in reading certain chapters (especially Chapter 7), but the glossary provided should help with some of the terminology that seemed impossible to avoid.

While this book has just one author, there are many people who have helped bring about whatever may be praiseworthy in it. In my graduate work I had the good fortune to take courses with Diana Natalicio, who recognized the seriousness of challenges to contrastive analysis in the 1960s and 1970s but who also recognized that the most extreme – albeit fashionable – criticisms of work on transfer were themselves open to challenges. Some of the more novel ideas in this book owe a great deal



xii Preface

to work by Jacquelyn Schachter, Sarah Grey Thomason, and Eric Kellerman, all of whom also provided valuable feedback on a number of my ideas. As this work took shape, Jack Richards provided much encouragement and support - without his interest, this book might never have been finished. Ellen Shaw and Linda Grossman of Cambridge University Press helped in many ways to see the manuscript through the final stages. I would also like to thank several people who made my search for studies of transfer easier by sending me some of their work: Christian Adjemian, David Birdsong, Susan Gass, Lynn Eubank, Markku Filppula, John Hinds, Richard Schmidt, David Singleton, and Lydia White. Many thanks are also due to Lisa Kiser, Alan Brown, and other members of the Department of English at Ohio State who provided valuable comments on earlier drafts of the manuscript. Moreover, I received many forms of assistance from friends and colleagues in the Department of English, the Department of Linguistics, the programs in English as a Second Language, and also from members of the Linguistics Institute of Ireland. In addition, I would like to acknowledge the generous support provided by other units at Ohio State, including the College of Humanities, the Office of Research and Graduate Studies, and the Instructional and Research Computation Center. Finally, I would like to thank my family for their encouragement not only with this project but with much else besides.