

**Assessing Writing** 



## THE CAMBRIDGE LANGUAGE ASSESSMENT SERIES

Series editors: J. Charles Alderson and Lyle F. Bachman

In this series:

Assessing Vocabulary by John Read
Assessing Reading by J. Charles Alderson
Assessing Languages for Specific Purposes by Dan Douglas
Assessing Listening by Gary Buck
Assessing Writing by Sara Cushing Weigle



# **Assessing Writing**

Sara Cushing Weigle





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town, 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

## © Cambridge University Press 2002

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002 Reprinted 2002

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface 9.5/13pt Utopia [CE]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 78027 6 hardback ISBN 0 521 78446 8 paperback



To my family: Clarke, Tommy, and James



## **Contents**

	Series Editors' Preface	page x
	Acknowledgements	xii
1	Introduction	1
2	The nature of writing ability	14
3	Basic considerations in assessing writing	39
4	Research in large-scale writing assessment	58
5	Designing writing assessment tasks	77
6	Scoring procedures for writing assessment	108
7	Illustrative tests of writing	140
8	Beyond the timed impromptu test: Classroom writing assessment	172
9	Portfolio assessment	197
10	The future of writing assessment	230
	Bibliography Index	245 261

ix



## Series Editors' Preface

Writing, which was once considered the domain of the elite and welleducated, has become an essential tool for people of all walks of life in today's global community. Whether used in reporting analyses of current events for newspapers or web pages, composing academic essays, business reports, letters, or e-mail messages, the ability to write effectively allows individuals from different cultures and backgrounds to communicate. Furthermore, it is now widely recognized that writing plays a vital role not only in conveying information, but also in transforming knowledge to create new knowledge. It is thus of central importance to students in academic and second language programs throughout the world. In many of these settings, the assessment of writing ability is of critical importance. Employers, academic instructors and writing teachers need to make decisions about potential employees and students, based on how well they can communicate in writing. But while the history of writing assessment goes back for centuries, it continues to be one of the most problematic areas of language use to assess. This is partly because of the vast diversity of writing purposes, styles, and genres, but primarily because of the subjectivity of the judgements involved in assessing samples of writing.

The author of this book, Dr. Sara Cushing Weigle, has extensive experience in teaching and assessing writing, and has conducted seminal research in this area. Her doctoral dissertation on writing assessment was awarded the TOEFL Award for Outstanding Doctoral Dissertation in Second/Foreign Language Testing in 1996, and she has since published numerous research studies in this area. Furthermore, her experience as a teacher has enabled her to present the complexities of writing assessment research and practice in a way that is readily accessible to practitioners and researchers alike.

X



Series Editors' Preface

хi

This book provides a coverage of writing assessment that is both broad and in-depth, discussing the relevant research and theory, and addressing practical considerations in the design, development and use of writing assessments. Beginning with a discussion of the nature of writing as both a social and cognitive activity, the author offers a thorough and critical review of the relevant research and theories of writing ability that provides the grounding for the rest of the book. She then proposes a conceptual framework for designing and developing writing assessments. In subsequent chapters, the author provides detailed discussions of procedures for designing writing assessment tasks and of scoring procedures, in the contexts of both large-scale and classroom assessment, illustrating her main points throughout with examples from a wide range of writing assessments. She devotes an entire chapter to an approach to assessment – portfolio assessment - that is both controversial and widely used, not only for writing assessment, but also for large-scale assessment of educational achievement. In her final chapter, the author looks ahead to examine the effects of technology on writing itself, and on writing pedagogy, as well as the potential contributions of new technologies to writing assessment. She also considers the politics of writing assessment, and the on-going tensions among different stakeholders about the nature of writing assessment, the ways in which these should be scored and interpreted, and the kinds of evidence that need to be provided to support the validity of the inferences and uses we make of the results of writing assessments.

In summary, this book provides a thorough discussion of practical issues and procedures in the design, development and use of writing assessments that is solidly grounded in research and theory. It thus has much to offer to both the test developer and the classroom teacher.

J. Charles Alderson Lyle F. Bachman



## Acknowledgements

In the summer of 1996, at the Language Testing Research Colloquium in Tampere, Finland, Lyle Bachman and Charles Alderson asked me if I would be interested in contributing a book on writing assessment to the new CUP series on language testing. In the ensuing five years I gave birth to my second child, moved with my family from Los Angeles to Atlanta to start a new job, bought a house, rejoiced with my much-loved father when he found and married the woman of his dreams, and mourned with my new stepmother a year later when Dad was diagnosed with pancreatic cancer and passed away. All the while Lyle and Charles, along with Mickey Bonin of Cambridge University Press, waited patiently for me to complete this manuscript and never gave up hope that I would eventually complete it. Now that it is finally finished, I need first of all to thank Lyle, Charles, and Mickey for their patience and unwavering support. I am also grateful for their guidance and feedback at every stage of the process. Lyle in particular has been willing to read and comment in detail on many drafts of each chapter, and I would like to acknowledge his many contributions to the book.

I am grateful for the support and encouragement of my colleagues at Georgia State University. In particular, I would like to thank my past and current department chairs, Joan Carson, Gayle Nelson, and Pat Byrd, for their support of this project in various ways. In addition, Gayle Nelson and Pat Dunkel have used drafts of several chapters of this book in their courses, and the feedback of their students has been helpful in improving the final product.

Two semesters of students in my Issues in Second Language Writing class have read and commented on drafts of several chapters of the book, and their comments have been quite insightful. In particular, I would like to thank Maria Ines Valsecchi and John Bunting for their comments and especially for their enthusiasm about the book at

xii



Acknowledgements x

a time when I was having my doubts about ever finishing it. My research assistant, Gerry Landers, was a tremendous help in getting the list of references and tables together. I would also like to thank Cindy Lutenbacher for giving me coffee, beer, and a shoulder to cry on, and Jim Purpura for lending humor and support from afar.

Finally, I would like to thank my family for their support. My husband Clarke has given me time and space for writing, listened to my complaints and suffered patiently through my temper tantrums, and supported me in a hundred other small ways that I am only now beginning to appreciate. My sons Tommy and James, simply by being their own delightful selves, have kept me mindful of the truly important things in life. A written acknowledgement could never sufficiently convey my gratitude to them, but I hope that a trip to the ice cream store will be a good start.

The publishers and I are grateful to the authors, publishers and others who have given permission for the use of copyright material identified in the text. It has not been possible to identify, or trace, sources of all the materials used and in such cases the publishers would welcome information from copyright owners.

Research in the teaching of English by AC Purves, A Soter, AS Takala & A Vahapassi. Copyright 1984 by the National Council of Teachers of English, Primary trait scoring by R Lloyd-Jones, CR Cooper & L Odell from Evaluating Writing. Copyright 1977 by the National Council of Teachers of English. Reprinted with permission. An overview of writing assessment: Theory, research and practice by W Wolcott (with SM Legg), Copyright 1998 by the National Council of Teachers of English. Criterion-referenced language test development by BK Lynch and F Davidson, reprinted with permission of Yale University Press. Extracts from Test development plan with specifications for placement instruments anchored to the model standards by FA Butler, SC Weigle, AB Kahn & EY Sato, CSE UCLA 1996. Proficiency sample project by M Apodaco, 1990. Test of English as a Foreign Language 2000. TOEFL materials are reprinted by permission of Educational Testing Service, the copyright owner; however, the test questions and any other testing information are provided in their entirety by Cambridge University Press. No endorsement of this publication by Educational Testing Service should be inferred. Testing ESL composition by H Jacobs, S Zinkgraf, D Wormuth, V Hartfiel & J Hughey (1981). Extract from Communicative language testing by CJ Weir, 1990. Extract from



#### xiv Acknowledgements

scoring procedures for ESL contexts in Assessing second language writing in academic contexts by L Hamp-Lyons. Copyright © 1991 L Hamp-Lyons. Reproduced with permission of Greenwood Publishing Group, Inc., Westport, CT. Language testing in practice by Lyle F Bachman & Adrian S Palmer © Lyle F Bachman & Adrian S Palmer 1996, reproduced by permission of Oxford University Press. Extracts from First Certificate in English: a handbook UCLES. Extracts from IELTS specimen Materials 1995, and IELTS Handbook 2002, UCLES. Extracts from Contextualized Writing Assessment (CARLA 2001). Designing and assessing effective classroom writing assignments for NES & ESL students, reprinted from Journal of second language writing, Vol 4 no 1 pp 17-41, J Reid and B Kroll, copyright 1995, with permission from Elsevier Science. Assessing the portfolio by L Hamp-Lyons and W Condon (2000), reprinted with the permission of Hampton Press, Inc. Checklist for portfolio contents from Portfolio plus: a critical guide to alternative assessment p169 by L Mabry copyright 1999, reprinted by permission of Sage Publications, Inc. Writing assessment by G Summer and E Spalding, University of Kentucky 1998. The development of large-scale placement assessment at the University of Michigan by M Willard-Traub, E Decker, R Reed & J Johnston, 1992-1998. Toward a new theory of writing assessment. College Composition and Communication, by B Huot. Copyright 1996 by the National Council of Teachers of English.

Atlanta, September 2001