

Table 3.6 – The Twelve Shīʿī Narrative Elements for Musā al-Kāẓim

Narrative category	al-Yaʿqūbī	al-Kulaynī	al-Masʿūdī	Ibn Bābawayh	al-Muʿid	al-Irbilī
1. Generosity Accounts						
Debt collector					X (<i>trihād</i>)	X
Cucumber farmer and locusts						X
Descendant of ʿUmar					X (<i>trihād</i>)	X
2. Knowledge Accounts						
Christian wanderer		X				
Nun and monk		X				
Debate with Abū Yūsuf				X		
Debate with al-Shaybānī					X (<i>trihād</i>)	X
Hishām and Muḥammad		X			X (<i>trihād</i>)	X
? Collapsing house prediction						X
? Brother's death prediction						X
? Chinese language						X
? Persian language					X (<i>trihād</i>)	X
S Prison release prediction		X				X
S Ishaq's family prediction		X				X and X and X (two unique accounts)
S Ibn Yaḥyā and black cloak					X (<i>trihād</i>)	X
S Locust swarm prediction						X
S Ibn Yaḥyā and ablution						X
S Correspondence with Yahyā		X			X (<i>trihād</i>)	X
S Exchange with al-Ḥusayn b. ʿAlī		X				
S Quarrel with brother						X
S Debate with Abū Yūsuf and al-Shaybānī						X
S Shāfiʿ al-Balkhī						X
3. Miracles						
Ascetic and tree		X			X (<i>trihād</i>)	X
Hot coals						X
Resurrected cow		X				
Resurrected donkey						X
Conversation with lion					X (<i>trihād</i>)	X

Narrative category	al-Ya'qubi	al-Kulayni	al-Mas'udi	Ibn Bibawayh	al-Mufid	al-Irbili
4 Figs and manure						X
4 Lion and charmer				X		
4. Confrontations with Power						
Refusal of human intercession	X					
al-Hadi's death prediction				X		X
Encounter with al-Ma'mun				X		
al-Mahdi and Q47:22						X
Prophet's grave					X (<i>Irbahat</i>)	X
Caliph and mule					X (<i>Irbahat</i>)	X
Debate with al-Rashid				X	X (<i>Ibbirigak</i>)	X
<i>Habashi</i> dream			X	X-2	X (<i>Ibbirigak</i>)	
Caliphal summons and dream				X		
5 Prison letter						X and X
5 Poisoned dog				X		
5 Poisoned dates		X		X		
3 Figs and manure						X
3 Lion and charmer				X		
5. Imprisonment and Death						
Betrayal by family member		X		X		X
Barmakid plot				X (partial)	X (<i>Irbahat</i>)	X
Cloth mistaken for al-Kazim				X-2 (al-Rashid, al-Fajl b. al-Rabi')		
4 Prison letter						X and X
4 Poisoned dog				X		
4 Poisoned dates		X		X		
Funeral procession				X		
Associates washing body						
Narratives on imprisonment	Yes	Yes (al-Shah)	No (silent)	X-2 (al-Sindi, Fajl al-Barmaki)	X (<i>Irbahat</i> (Sindi))	X (al-Sindi)
Narratives featuring poison	No (silent)	Yes	Yes	X (al-Rashid, Fajl al-Barmaki)	Yes (Fajl al-Barmaki/al-Sindi)	Yes (Yahya al-Barmaki/al-Sindi)
Narratives of body being examined	X (Mas'ur)			X (Sulayman b. Abi Ja'far)		

The (s) in the first column of knowledge accounts indicates supernatural knowledge. Numbers in the first column denote narratives that fit in other categories.